Modal Mixture

Much music of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries commonly employs a type of chromaticism that cannot be said to derive from applied functions and tonicization. In fact, the chromaticism often appears to be nonfunctional—a mere coloring of the melodic and harmonic surface of the music.

Listen to the two phrases of Example 21.1. The first phrase (mm. 1–8) contains exclusively diatonic harmonies, but the second phrase (mm. 11–21) is full of chromaticism. This creates sonorities, such as the A^b-major chord in m. 15, which appear to be distant from the underlying F-major tonic. The chromatic harmonies in mm. 11–20 have been labeled with letter names that indicate the root and quality of the chord.

EXAMPLE 21.1 Mascagni, "A casa amici" ("Homeward, friends"), *Cavalleria Rusticana*, scene 9





These sonorities share an important feature: All but the cadential V–I are members of the parallel mode, F minor. Viewing this progression through the lens of F minor reveals a simple bass arpeggiation that briefly tonicizes

419

III (A^{\flat}), then moves to PD and D, followed by a final resolution to major tonic in the major mode.

The Mascagni excerpt is quite remarkable in its tonal plan. Although it begins and ends in F major, a significant portion of the music behaves as though written in F minor. This technique of borrowing harmonies from the parallel mode is called **modal mixture** (sometimes known simply as **mixture**). We have already encountered two instances of modal mixture. The first occurred as the "Picardy third," the cadence seen in minor-mode works that raises $\hat{3}$ to end on a major chord. A second instance arose through the use of the fully diminished seventh chord in the major mode, which had $\downarrow \hat{6}$ as its seventh.

Although harmonies may be borrowed from either the parallel major or minor, *it is much more common for elements of the minor mode to be imported into the major mode*. A quick review of the possible pitch material in the major and minor modes reveals why: In the minor mode, $\hat{6}$ and $\hat{7}$ each have two forms, depending on whether the melodic line ascends or descends. Consequently, the importation of natural $\hat{6}$ into a minor piece results from good voice leading and is not surprising. By contrast, the major mode does not include the altered forms of $\hat{3}$, $\hat{6}$, and $\hat{7}$; thus, if a musical passage is forging ahead in a major key but then introduces $\flat \hat{6}$, the effect can be quite shocking.

Altered Pre-Dominant Harmonies: ii° and iv

The most common scale degree involved in modal mixture is $\hat{6}$. There are four reasons why this is so:

- 1. $\hat{6}$ is least likely to undermine the integrity of the home key and mode.
- 2. Lowering 6 permits a strong half-step motion to the dominant.
- 3. Modal mixture invoked on $\hat{6}$ colors all PD harmonies.
- 4. 6 is the only scale degree outside of the tonic triad that can be consonantly supported by a harmony with 1 in the bass. Therefore, it is a component of the contrapuntal 5–6 motion that figures prominently in music.

Example 21.2 shows how $\sqrt{6}$, which is drawn from the parallel minor, alters the most common pre-dominants, ii, ii⁷, and IV; the supertonic harmony becomes a diminished triad (ii°), ii⁷ becomes a half-diminished seventh, and the subdominant becomes a minor triad (iv). This type of chromatic alteration—which changes the quality of a chord but does not alter its root—is called **melodic mixture**. The labeling of chords to reflect melodic mixture is easy: You label the chord as if it were in a minor key.

EXAMPLE 21.2 Mixture Applied to Pre-Dominant Harmonies



Application: Musical Effects of Melodic Mixture

We now explore the musical contexts for mixture chords. Listen to Example 21.3, and focus on the downbeat of m. 3, where mixture appears as the PD seventh chord incorporates $\frac{1}{6}$ to become ii^{ø7}. One way to view this melodic mixture is to interpret the A^{\downarrow} in the voice—a heartbreaking cry—as a surprising foreign tone to C major. When A^{\downarrow} enters the melody in m. 3, it has a highly poetic function. Schumann is able to underscore the speaker's pain ("I bear no grudge, even if my heart breaks") by introducing dissonance through modal mixture. The jarring entrance of the A^{\downarrow} shatters the major mode, just as the poet's heart ("Herz") is broken. Schumann leads the phrase to its high point on the word *heart*, extending the word for most of m. 3. The A^{\downarrow} continues to intensify the pain by forming an even more dissonant minor ninth when the A^{\downarrow} is sustained over the dominant (G).

EXAMPLE 21.3 Schumann, "Ich grolle nicht" ("I bear no grudge"), Dichterliebe, op. 48, no. 7



Finally, melodic mixture harmonies work very well in contrapuntal expansions of the tonic, especially as embedded phrase models (EPMs), shown in Example 21.4.

EXAMPLE 21.4 Mixture and EPMs



Altered Submediant Harmony: VI

In melodic mixture $ensuremath{6}^{6}$ appears as the *third* or the *fifth* of a mixture chord. A different situation occurs when $ensuremath{6}^{6}$ appears as the *root* of a mixture chord. In these cases, the root of the chord has been shifted down from its usual

position. We describe this as **harmonic mixture** and write roman numerals to reflect the change in the root. In Example 21.5 the A^{β}-major chord, with $\hat{\beta}$ as the root, is analyzed as a β VI chord.



Take a moment to examine the nomenclature for harmonic mixture (Example 21.5). Notice that the lowered root of the chord is indicated by a flat sign placed before the roman numeral. If the root $(\frac{1}{6})$ were the only altered pitch in the submediant chord, however, the resulting sonority would be a dissonant augmented triad (e.g., in C major, A^L–C–E^L), an unstable chord that common-practice composers never used as an independent harmony. Therefore, mixture is also applied to $\hat{3}$ in order to produce a consonant major triad on VI (just as it is in minor).

We use the generic "VI" to refer to all major triads built on the lowered form of $\hat{6}$ and when generally describing the chord, even if a natural, rather than a flat, is used to notate the chord (e.g., in A major, the VI chord is built on F-natural, not F-flat). Despite its new roman numeral and chromatic inflection, VI continues to function as a submediant chord.

- 1. It participates in descending arpeggiations (Example 21.5A).
- 2. It participates in descending-fifth motions (Example 21.5B).
- 3. It precedes the dominant as a PD chord.
- 4. It follows the dominant (and substitutes for the tonic chord) in deceptive motions (Example 21.5C).
- 5. Because VI lies a half step away from the dominant, composers often take advantage of this proximity by using VI motivically as a dramatic upper neighbor that extends V.

Altered Tonic Harmony: i

In addition to being part of VI, $\frac{1}{3}$ creates melodic mixture in altered tonic harmonies. Eighteenth-century composers were keenly aware of the ambiguity that can result from making a major tonic minor. Because this modal juxtaposition calls the mode of an entire piece into question, a minor tonic is more often only implied rather than literally stated. For example, in Example 21.6, the long chromatic line—which extends the dominant (before it returns to the tonic) and includes Fieminplies the parallel mode, D minor.



Despite this destabilizing effect, some eighteenth-century composersincluding not only Bach but also Classical composers such as Haydn and Mozart—invoked modal mixture on the tonic. By the nineteenth century, some composers (such as Schubert) began to saturate their major-mode pieces with elements of the minor to such a degree that the 24 major and minor keys seem to have fused into 12 major-minor keys. For example, it would seem impossible to tell if a piece were in D major or D minor if it had equal numbers of F#s/F4s and B4s/B4s; you could only be sure it was in D. Listen to Example 21.7 and note how the key of F major is pervaded with elements of F minor, including a tonicization of III (A^b).





Sehr langsam (Molto adagio)

Continued



Altered Mediant Harmony: HII

Just as VI arose from harmonic mixture, so too does the III chord, which has \hat{J} as its root. The III chord also borrows \hat{J} to create a consonant major triad. As Example 21.8 shows, III continues to function as a mediant chord.

- 1. It divides the fifth between I and V into two smaller thirds (Example 21.8A).
- 2. It is a bridge between T and PD (Example 21.8B and D).
- 3. It participates in descending-fifths motion (Example 21.7C), although less often than the diatonic iii chord.
- 4. It is a PD chord (Example 21.8A and E).
- 5. It can be preceded by its dominant (in minor keys, V/III leads to III; in major keys, this progression becomes V/^bIII to ^bIII) (Example 21.8F).
- 6. It also is a substitute for I⁶ (although not nearly as common as diatonic iii, given that 3 is lowered in ¹III; see Example 21.8D).

EXAMPLE 21.8 Common Contexts for HII



424



Voice Leading for Mixture Harmonies

The following guidelines restate and develop the rules we used when writing applied chords.

- Avoid doubling a chromatically altered tone unless it is the root of a chord (as in ^bVI).
- Since ¹6 will be either a neighbor tone (5⁻¹6⁻⁵) or a descending passing tone (6⁻¹6⁻⁵), prepare and resolve it by step motion. Keeping the chromatic line 6⁻¹6⁻⁵ in a single voice will help avoid cross relations.
- Once you introduce VI, iv or ii°, continue to use mixture chords until you reach the dominant function. This is because bô possesses such a powerful drive to 5 that any intrusion of the diatonic ô would not only create a jarring cross relation but also ruin the drive to the dominant (Example 21.9).

EXAMPLE 21.9 Part Writing Mixture Chords



EXERCISE INTERLUDE

WRITING

21.1

Complete the given varied tasks.

- Exercise A. Add upper voices to the bass line; include one example of mixture. Analyze.
- Exercise B. Complete the progression in four voices.



Determine the locations and types of mixture harmonies in the following excerpts. *Remember that not all chromatically altered chords result from mixture; some are applied chords.* Mixture harmonies are independent chords that participate in the harmonic progression and usually carry a pre-dominant function. Applied harmonies, by contrast, function as dominants and thus merely point to more important chords that are tonicized. Provide a two-level harmonic analysis.







SOLVED/APP 6

C. J. S. Bach, "Christus, der ist mein Leben"



SOLVED/APP 6

D.



E. Mizzou Waltz









Chromatic Stepwise Bass Descents

In Chapter 13 we encountered two types of stepwise bass descents leading to the dominant. Because there are two diatonic forms of $\hat{6}$ and $\hat{7}$ in minor, it is possible for this descent to be completely chromaticized (e.g., $\hat{1}-\hat{7}-\hat{9}-\hat{6}-\hat{6}-\hat{5}$) in a minor piece, as shown in Example 21.10A, where Geminiani writes a fully chromatic descending bass line by using an applied chord (V_2^4 of IV) that leads to major IV⁶. With modal mixture, we can import this powerful progression into major-mode pieces. Examples 21.10B and C illustrate two common settings. Example 21.10B shows a direct descent to V, and Example 21.10C shows an indirect descent to PD on $\hat{4}$, followed by the dominant. Note that the use of a passing minor v⁶ in Example 21.10C leads to the pre-dominant, which is expanded through a **chromatic voice exchange** (where the **A**/F in the IV⁶ chord are exchanged by the F/ A_{i} in the ii^{o6} chord).

EXAMPLE 21.10 The Chromaticized Step-Descent Bass

A. Geminiani, The Art of Playing the Violin, op. 9, no. 8



428







Notice that chromatic voice exchanges necessarily involve strong cross relations. In such cases, intervening passing chords diminish any harshness that would have occurred in a direct succession of chromatic tones. It is best to avoid direct outer-voice cross relations; instead, keep the chromatic motion within a single voice (Example 21.10D).

Plagal Motions

During the nineteenth century, the role of the dominant harmony gradually changed. For the most part, progressions still led to the tonic, but the dominant was often conspicuously absent from the cadence. This is due largely to nineteenth-century composers' obsession with creating novel harmonic combinations, along with a general distaste for commonplace formulas such as V^7 –I. The growing acceptance of mixture harmonies partially accounts for this change, since their dramatic effects made them popular substitutes for the dominant.

For example, iv leads convincingly to the dominant in both major and minor modes. However, because 6 strongly desires resolution by half step to 5, iv also can move directly to the tonic at a cadence (Example 21.11A). Plagal motion is not restricted to the subdominant. Both the supertonic and the submediant may move directly to tonic (Examples 21.11B and C). The cadence in Example 21.11B is commonly heard in popular music of the 1920s through the 1950s and in films today, and is therefore called a **Hollywood cadence**. Notice that the Hollywood cadence is a chromatically embellished plagal cadence (IV–I); a contrapuntal 5–6 motion and mixture transform IV into ii_{5}^{06} before the resolution to the tonic chord. We use the term **plagal motion** and the abbreviation "PL" at the second level to describe progressions in which harmonies other than the dominant lead to the tonic.



Notice both the absence of dominant harmony (even at the final cadence) and the prominence of mixture in Example 21.12. The passage begins with an expansion of tonic harmony through an upper-neighbor figure G–A–G in the alto. Although a repetition of this figure is expected in m. 3, VI instead participates in the upper-neighbor figure, now chromaticized (G–A \models -G). The mixture continues with VI and minor iv resolving to the tonic in a plagal cadence.





The prominence of the neighbor figure—in particular, the conflict between A^{\ddagger} and A^{\ddagger}—indicates that this gesture is motivic. In fact, this motive is not restricted to the slow movement of Brahms's third symphony. The seeds are planted in the opening measures of the symphony's first movement (Example 21.13). The A^{\ddagger}/A^{\ddagger} conflict is set into motion by the cross relation in mm. 1–2 and is intensified in mm. 3 by a voice exchange. This pitch-class conflict between A^{\ddagger} and A^{$\frac{1}{2}$} that takes place in the first and second movements seems especially important, given that the two movements are in different keys: A^{\ddagger} and A^{$\frac{1}{2}$} function as $\hat{3}$ and $\frac{1}{3}$ in F major; in C major they are $\hat{6}$ and $\frac{1}{6}$.



Modal Mixture, Applied Chords, and Other Chromatic Harmonies

Two tonal processes account for chromaticism in tonal music.

- 1. Tonicization is intimately associated with *dominant* function, as new chromatic tones act as *temporary leading tones*.
- 2. Modal mixture usually occurs within the *pre-dominant* function, as the new chromatic tones retain their scale degree function but in an *altered* form.

Occasionally, composers use two other chromatic harmonies on $\hat{3}$ and $\hat{6}$ of a major key, but these harmonies are *not* products of tonicization or modal mixture. The first is a major mediant chord (III) whose root is diatonic $\hat{3}$. Like diatonic iii and mixture ^JIII, III most often is part of a rising bass arpeggiation (I–III–V), which may include a PD (I–III–IV–V).

Look at Example 21.14A. The piece is in E major. Note that the G[#]-major triad is not an applied chord (V/vi), but rather a self-standing harmony. The second chromatic harmony that one occasionally encounters is a major submediant chord (VI) whose root is the diatonic $\hat{6}$ (Example 21.14B). And, like vi and $^{\flat}$ VI, VI most often leads to IV. Note that had VI led to ii, it would be

better interpreted as V/ii rather than VI (e.g., in C major, VI [A major] leading to ii [D minor] would sound more like an applied chord than an independent harmony). That VI is an independent harmony is made clear by the behavior of C[#] (in the alto): Rather than ascending to D, as it would had it functioned as an applied chord, it instead descends to C[§].

EXAMPLE 21.14











Indeed, it is important in your analysis that you discern between these chords and applied dominant chords. For a final example, if you encounter a D-major harmony in B^{\flat} major, you must determine whether it is the applied V/vi or the chromatic III chord. In Example 21.15A, D major functions as a chromatic mediant chord (III), leading to the PD ii⁶ chord. In Example 21.15B, D major is V/vi, an applied dominant chord leading to G minor (vi).

EXAMPLE 21.15 III# Versus V/vi



Summary

The major tonic now has access to three sets of third relations: to the *diatonic* upper and lower thirds (iii, vi), to the *raised chromatic* thirds (III, VI), and to the *lowered chromatic thirds* resulting from modal mixture (III, VI). Notice that the minor tonic's options for third relations are very limited: A minor tonic will usually move only to its diatonic III and VI. Example 21.16 shows how the submediant and mediant harmonies fit into the common-practice tonal scheme. Upper thirds lead to $\hat{5}$ through arpeggiation, and lower thirds lead to $\hat{4}$ through arpeggiation.

EXAMPLE 21.16





21.3-21.4

Modal mixture plays a central role in tonal music—one that is much more varied than merely coloring harmonies for musical contrast. When paired with their diatonic counterparts, mixture chords present the potential for powerful musical conflicts that are often dramatically worked out over the course of a work.

The complex workings of chromatic pitches became a critical feature of nineteenth-century compositions. Through modal mixture, a chromatic pitch may appear early and at the surface of a work. As the work progresses, the mixture accrues significance and evolves until it participates in the deepest levels of musical structure.

EXERCISE INTERLUDE

ANALYSIS

21.4

Analyze the following examples, which illustrate plagal motions and other chromatic chords.





SOLVED/APP 6



C. "Heartfelt Greeting Card" What type of period is this?





SOLVED/APP 6

D. Chopin, Nocturne in C minor, op. 48, no. 1



E. Beethoven, Piano Trio no. 5 in D major, "Ghost," op. 70, no. 1, Presto



COMPOSITION

21.5

Complete the following tasks in four-voice chorale style (choose a meter) on a separate sheet of manuscript paper. Analyze; then play your solutions on the keyboard.

SOLVED/APP 6

- A. In D major, write a progression that expands tonic with a mixture chord, includes two suspensions, and incorporates VI.
- B. In A major, write a progression that contains two short phrases that create a PIP, includes ii_{5}^{66} in the first phrase and iv in the second phrase, and includes an applied chord in each phrase.
- C. Given an F-major triad, use it correctly within progressions in the keys of B^J major, D minor, D major, and A major.
- D. In E major, write a progression that includes a chromatic step-descent bass that leads to iv. Close with a PAC.

TERMS AND CONCEPTS

- chromatic voice exchange
- Hollywood cadence
- mixture
 - harmonic mixture
 - melodic mixture
 - modal mixture
- plagal relations